

## Research Article

# Validation of an Artificial Intelligence Model for the Diagnosis of Thyroid Nodules: A Prospective Multicenter Study

Francesco Pignataro<sup>1\*</sup>, Leo GUIDOBALDI<sup>2</sup>, Marco Gismant<sup>3</sup>,  
Manuela Nestola<sup>4</sup> and Cristina Nisita<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Director of the Diagnostic Imaging Department of the Humanitas University Consortium, Italy

<sup>2</sup>Cytopathologist, UOC Pathological Anatomy Sandro Pertini Hospital, Rome, Italy

<sup>3</sup>Specialist in Internal Medicine Responsible for the Internal Ultrasound service in diagnostic centers in Rome, Italy

<sup>4</sup>Specialist in Internal Medicine - Internal Multiparametric Ultrasound Service - Altamedica Research Center Rome, Italy

<sup>5</sup>Specialist in Gastroenterology and Digestive Endoscopy, Senior Sonographer in diagnostic centers in Rome, Italy

## Abstract

**Objective:** To validate the diagnostic accuracy of an artificial intelligence (AI) model in the diagnosis of thyroid nodules, comparing the results with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology.

**Methods:** A prospective multicenter study that included 1500 thyroid nodules undergoing multiparametric ultrasound (two-dimensional ultrasound with 18 and 22 MHz probes, SMI power Doppler study, and strain ratio elastography) and fine-needle aspiration for cytological examination. The cases were numbered and double-blindly associated with cytological results and expert sonographers' evaluation. The images were analyzed by a machine learning algorithm and ChatBot Claude 3 Opus to create datasets. The predictive model was tested on another 1000 cases, defining the TIRADS level of suspicion. The results were compared with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology using statistical tests.

\*Corresponding author: Francesco Pignataro, Director of the Diagnostic Imaging Department of the Humanitas University Consortium, Italy; E-mail: pignatarofrancesco@yahoo.it

**Citation:** Pignataro F, GUIDOBALDI L, Gismant M, Nestola M, Nisita C (2024) Validation of an Artificial Intelligence Model for the Diagnosis of Thyroid Nodules: A Prospective Multicenter Study. J Clin Stud Med Case Rep 11: 239.

**Received:** May 29, 2024; **Accepted:** June 13, 2024; **Published:** June 20, 2024

**Copyright:** © 2024 Pignataro F, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

**Results:** The AI model showed a sensitivity of 96% (95% CI: 94-98%), a specificity of 95% (95% CI: 93-97%), and a correspondence with the evaluation of expert sonographers of over 95%.

The agreement with cytological analysis was 94%. The results were statistically significant ( $p < 0.001$ ).

**Conclusion:** The AI model validated in this study demonstrated high diagnostic accuracy in the evaluation of thyroid nodules, with a strong agreement with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology. The clinical implementation of this model could improve the management of patients with thyroid nodules, reducing inter-operator variability.

## Introduction

Thyroid nodules are a common clinical condition, with an estimated prevalence of 20-70% in the general population [1]. Most thyroid nodules are benign, but 5-15% can be malignant [2]. Accurate diagnosis of thyroid nodules is crucial to identify patients who need further investigation or therapeutic interventions. Ultrasound is the first-line imaging method for the evaluation of thyroid nodules, but its interpretation may be subject to inter-operator variability [3].

Artificial intelligence (AI) has shown promising results in various fields of medicine, including diagnostic imaging [4]. The objective of this study is to validate the diagnostic accuracy of an AI model in the diagnosis of thyroid nodules, comparing the results with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology.

## Materials and Methods

### Study design

A prospective multicenter study was conducted that included 1500 thyroid nodules in consecutive patients undergoing thyroid ultrasound at three referral centers for thyroid pathology. All images were managed anonymously with exclusive numerical concordance and all participants provided written informed consent.

### Acquisition of ultrasound images

All thyroid nodules were evaluated by multiparametric ultrasound, including two-dimensional ultrasound with 18 and 22 MHz probes when possible, SMI power Doppler study, strain ratio elastography, and micropure analysis. The images were acquired by expert sonographers, following a standardized sequential protocol.

### Cytological analysis

All nodules underwent fine-needle aspiration for cytological examination, interpreted by experienced cytopathologists according to the Bethesda system [5,6]. Cases with indeterminate or suspect cytology for malignancy underwent repeat fine-needle aspiration or surgical intervention, depending on the overall clinical picture.

### Development and validation of the AI model

The ultrasound images were analyzed by a machine-learning algorithm developed using a convolutional neural network (CNN) trained

on a large dataset of ultrasound images of thyroid nodules with cytological diagnosis and expert ultrasound evaluation. The CNN architecture included 5 convolutional layers, followed by pooling and fully connected layers. The algorithm was trained using the transfer learning technique, starting from a pre-trained network on a generic image dataset (ImageNet) and refining the connection weights on the specific dataset of thyroid nodules. Training was performed on an NVIDIA Tesla V100 GPU, using the Adam optimizer and the binary cross-entropy loss function. In addition, the images were analyzed by ChatBot Claude 3 Opus, a conversational AI system based on an auto-regressive language model (GPT-3), to create structured datasets containing the relevant ultrasound features of the nodules.

The AI model was validated using a k-fold cross-validation technique (k=5), dividing the dataset into training, validation, and test subsets. Model performance was evaluated in terms of sensitivity, specificity, accuracy, and area under the ROC curve (AUC). Subsequently, the model was tested on an independent dataset of 1000 thyroid nodules, defining the TIRADS level of suspicion. The results were compared with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology using chi-square test and analysis of variance (ANOVA).

## Results

### Characteristics of thyroid nodules

Of the 1500 thyroid nodules included in the study, 1200 (80%) were benign and 300 (20%) were malignant according to the evaluation of expert sonographers. The mean size of the nodules was 18±9 mm for benign nodules and 22±11 mm for malignant nodules (p<0.001). Malignant nodules more frequently presented irregular margins (75% vs 20%, p<0.001), microcalcifications (60% vs 15%, p<0.001), and intralesional vascularity (70% vs 30%, p<0.001) compared to benign nodules.

### AI model performance

The AI model showed a sensitivity of 96% (95% CI: 94-98%), a specificity of 95% (95% CI: 93-97%), and an accuracy of 95% (95% CI: 94-96%) in the diagnosis of thyroid nodules, with an AUC of 0.98 (95% CI: 0.97-0.99). The correspondence with the evaluation of expert sonographers was 95% (95% CI: 94-96%), while the agreement with cytological analysis was 94% (95% CI: 93-95%). The results were statistically significant (p<0.001).

In the validation dataset of 1000 nodules, the AI model showed a sensitivity of 95% (95% CI: 92-97%), a specificity of 94% (95% CI: 92-96%), and an accuracy of 94% (95% CI: 93-95%) in defining the TIRADS level of suspicion. The agreement with the evaluation of expert sonographers was 94% (95% CI: 92-95%) and with cytology was 93% (95% CI: 91-94%). The results were statistically significant (p<0.001).

## Discussion

This study validated an AI model for the diagnosis of thyroid nodules, demonstrating high diagnostic accuracy and strong agreement with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology. The results suggest that the clinical implementation of this model could improve the management of patients with thyroid nodules, reducing inter-operator variability and increasing the efficiency of the clinical workflow.

The use of AI in the diagnosis of thyroid nodules has been the subject of growing interest in recent years [7,8]. However, most previous studies were based on retrospective datasets or compared the performance of AI only with cytology, without considering expert ultrasound evaluation. The present study overcomes these limitations, providing a prospective multicenter validation of the AI model and comparing the results with both the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology.

The strengths of this study include the prospective design, the sample size, and the use of a standardized protocol for the acquisition of ultrasound images. Furthermore, the use of a conversational AI system (ChatBot Claude 3 Opus) for the creation of structured datasets represents an innovative approach, which could facilitate the integration of AI into clinical practice.

However, the study also has some limitations. First, despite multicenter validation, the results may not be generalizable to all populations of patients with thyroid nodules. Second, it was not possible to obtain histological confirmation for all nodules, limiting the evaluation of the diagnostic accuracy of the AI model. Finally, the clinical implementation of this model will require further evaluations of feasibility, acceptability, and impact on patient outcomes.

In conclusion, this study validated an AI model for the diagnosis of thyroid nodules, demonstrating high diagnostic accuracy and strong agreement with the evaluation of expert sonographers and cytology. The clinical implementation of this model could improve the management of patients with thyroid nodules, reducing inter-operator variability and increasing the efficiency of the clinical workflow. Further studies are needed to confirm these results and evaluate the impact of AI on patient outcomes and clinical practice.

## References

- Guth S, Theune U, Aberle J, Galach A, Bamberger CM (2009) Very high prevalence of thyroid nodules detected by high frequency (13 MHz) ultrasound examination. *Eur J Clin Invest.* 39: 699-706.
- Gharib H, Papini E, Garber JR, Duick DS, Harrell RM, et al. (2016) American Association of Clinical Endocrinologists, American College of Endocrinology, and Associazione Medici Endocrinologi Medical Guidelines for Clinical Practice for the Diagnosis and Management of Thyroid Nodules--2016 Update. *Endocr Pract.* 22: 622-639.
- Choi SH, Kim EK, Kwak JY, Kim MJ, Son EJ (2010) Interobserver and intraobserver variations in ultrasound assessment of thyroid nodules. *Thyroid.* 20: 167-172.
- Bi WL, Hosny A, Schabath MB, Giger ML, Birkbak NJ, et al. (2019) Artificial intelligence in cancer imaging: Clinical challenges and applications. *CA Cancer J Clin.* 69: 127-157.
- Tessler FN, Middleton WD, Grant EG, Hoang JK, Berland LL, et al. (2017) ACR Thyroid Imaging, Reporting and Data System (TI-RADS): White Paper of the ACR TI-RADS Committee. *J Am Coll Radiol.* 14: 587-595.
- Cibas ES, Ali SZ (2017) The 2017 Bethesda System for Reporting Thyroid Cytopathology. *Thyroid.* 27: 1341-1346.
- Li X, Zhang S, Zhang Q, Wei X, Pan Y, et al. (2019) Diagnosis of thyroid cancer using deep convolutional neural network models applied to sonographic images: a retrospective, multicohort, diagnostic study. *Lancet Oncol.* 20: 193-201
- Buda M, Wildman-Tobriner B, Hoang JK, Thayer D, Tessler FN, et al. (2019) Management of Thyroid Nodules Seen on US Images: Deep Learning May Match Performance of Radiologists. *Radiology.* 292: 695-701.



Advances In Industrial Biotechnology | ISSN: 2639-5665  
Advances In Microbiology Research | ISSN: 2689-694X  
Archives Of Surgery And Surgical Education | ISSN: 2689-3126  
Archives Of Urology  
Archives Of Zoological Studies | ISSN: 2640-7779  
Current Trends Medical And Biological Engineering  
International Journal Of Case Reports And Therapeutic Studies | ISSN: 2689-310X  
Journal Of Addiction & Addictive Disorders | ISSN: 2578-7276  
Journal Of Agronomy & Agricultural Science | ISSN: 2689-8292  
Journal Of AIDS Clinical Research & STDs | ISSN: 2572-7370  
Journal Of Alcoholism Drug Abuse & Substance Dependence | ISSN: 2572-9594  
Journal Of Allergy Disorders & Therapy | ISSN: 2470-749X  
Journal Of Alternative Complementary & Integrative Medicine | ISSN: 2470-7562  
Journal Of Alzheimers & Neurodegenerative Diseases | ISSN: 2572-9608  
Journal Of Anesthesia & Clinical Care | ISSN: 2378-8879  
Journal Of Angiology & Vascular Surgery | ISSN: 2572-7397  
Journal Of Animal Research & Veterinary Science | ISSN: 2639-3751  
Journal Of Aquaculture & Fisheries | ISSN: 2576-5523  
Journal Of Atmospheric & Earth Sciences | ISSN: 2689-8780  
Journal Of Biotech Research & Biochemistry  
Journal Of Brain & Neuroscience Research  
Journal Of Cancer Biology & Treatment | ISSN: 2470-7546  
Journal Of Cardiology Study & Research | ISSN: 2640-768X  
Journal Of Cell Biology & Cell Metabolism | ISSN: 2381-1943  
Journal Of Clinical Dermatology & Therapy | ISSN: 2378-8771  
Journal Of Clinical Immunology & Immunotherapy | ISSN: 2378-8844  
Journal Of Clinical Studies & Medical Case Reports | ISSN: 2378-8801  
Journal Of Community Medicine & Public Health Care | ISSN: 2381-1978  
Journal Of Cytology & Tissue Biology | ISSN: 2378-9107  
Journal Of Dairy Research & Technology | ISSN: 2688-9315  
Journal Of Dentistry Oral Health & Cosmesis | ISSN: 2473-6783  
Journal Of Diabetes & Metabolic Disorders | ISSN: 2381-201X  
Journal Of Emergency Medicine Trauma & Surgical Care | ISSN: 2378-8798  
Journal Of Environmental Science Current Research | ISSN: 2643-5020  
Journal Of Food Science & Nutrition | ISSN: 2470-1076  
Journal Of Forensic Legal & Investigative Sciences | ISSN: 2473-733X  
Journal Of Gastroenterology & Hepatology Research | ISSN: 2574-2566  
Journal Of Genetics & Genomic Sciences | ISSN: 2574-2485  
Journal Of Gerontology & Geriatric Medicine | ISSN: 2381-8662  
Journal Of Hematology Blood Transfusion & Disorders | ISSN: 2572-2999  
Journal Of Hospice & Palliative Medical Care  
Journal Of Human Endocrinology | ISSN: 2572-9640  
Journal Of Infectious & Non Infectious Diseases | ISSN: 2381-8654  
Journal Of Internal Medicine & Primary Healthcare | ISSN: 2574-2493  
Journal Of Light & Laser Current Trends  
Journal Of Medicine Study & Research | ISSN: 2639-5657  
Journal Of Modern Chemical Sciences  
Journal Of Nanotechnology Nanomedicine & Nanobiotechnology | ISSN: 2381-2044  
Journal Of Neonatology & Clinical Pediatrics | ISSN: 2378-878X  
Journal Of Nephrology & Renal Therapy | ISSN: 2473-7313  
Journal Of Non Invasive Vascular Investigation | ISSN: 2572-7400  
Journal Of Nuclear Medicine Radiology & Radiation Therapy | ISSN: 2572-7419  
Journal Of Obesity & Weight Loss | ISSN: 2473-7372  
Journal Of Ophthalmology & Clinical Research | ISSN: 2378-8887  
Journal Of Orthopedic Research & Physiotherapy | ISSN: 2381-2052  
Journal Of Otolaryngology Head & Neck Surgery | ISSN: 2573-010X  
Journal Of Pathology Clinical & Medical Research  
Journal Of Pharmacology Pharmaceutics & Pharmacovigilance | ISSN: 2639-5649  
Journal Of Physical Medicine Rehabilitation & Disabilities | ISSN: 2381-8670  
Journal Of Plant Science Current Research | ISSN: 2639-3743  
Journal Of Practical & Professional Nursing | ISSN: 2639-5681  
Journal Of Protein Research & Bioinformatics  
Journal Of Psychiatry Depression & Anxiety | ISSN: 2573-0150  
Journal Of Pulmonary Medicine & Respiratory Research | ISSN: 2573-0177  
Journal Of Reproductive Medicine Gynaecology & Obstetrics | ISSN: 2574-2574  
Journal Of Stem Cells Research Development & Therapy | ISSN: 2381-2060  
Journal Of Surgery Current Trends & Innovations | ISSN: 2578-7284  
Journal Of Toxicology Current Research | ISSN: 2639-3735  
Journal Of Translational Science And Research  
Journal Of Vaccines Research & Vaccination | ISSN: 2573-0193  
Journal Of Virology & Antivirals  
Sports Medicine And Injury Care Journal | ISSN: 2689-8829  
Trends In Anatomy & Physiology | ISSN: 2640-7752

Submit Your Manuscript: <https://www.heraldopenaccess.us/submit-manuscript>